arXiv:1609.01066v1 [math.PR] 5 Sep 2016

Coupon collector's probabilities and generating function: analytic approach

Andrea Monsellato

September 6, 2016

Abstract

Despite the coupon collector's problem has simple probabilistic solution using inclusion/exclusion principle [3], starting from a particular type of recurrence differential equation it is used an analytic approach to recover explicit probabilities and generating function. Note that this kind of recurrence differential equations often appear in Polya Urn context [3].

1 Introduction

Coupon collector's problem statement is the following: There are m (finite) different coupons to collect. The coupons are obtained at random, drawing from a box that contains all coupons numbered from 1 to m. When a coupon is collected the player keeps it, and the drawn coupon is replaced with a new identical coupon. The target is to collect at least one coupon of every type.

There are some different approaches to derive explicit probabilities of the problem, i.e. the probabilities to have collected $k \in [1, m]$ coupons after n draws, for example see [2],[1],[3].

2 From master equation to recurrence differential equation

The master equation collector's problems is the following:

$$p_{n,k} = p_{n-1,k-1}\frac{m-k+1}{m} + p_{n-1,k}\frac{k}{m} \tag{1}$$

where n is the step, k is the number of coupons collected and $0 < m < +\infty$ is the total number of coupons. It is obvious that $0 \leq k \leq m$.

Using conditional probabilities, from (1), it follows that, for $k \in [1, m]$:

$$E(e^{\lambda X_n}) = E(E(e^{\lambda X_n}|X_{n-1})) = E\left(e^{\lambda(X_{n-1}+1)}\frac{m-X_{n-1}}{m} + e^{\lambda X_{n-1}}\frac{X_{n-1}}{m}\right) =$$
$$= E\left(e^{\lambda}e^{\lambda X_{n-1}}\left(1-\frac{X_{n-1}}{m}\right) + e^{\lambda X_{n-1}}\frac{X_{n-1}}{m}\right)$$

Now set $f_n(e^{\lambda}) = E(e^{\lambda X_n})$ follows that

$$
\begin{aligned}
E(e^{\lambda X_n}) &= E\left(e^{\lambda} e^{\lambda X_{n-1}} \left(1 - \frac{X_{n-1}}{m}\right) + e^{\lambda X_{n-1}} \frac{X_{n-1}}{m}\right) = \\
&= e^{\lambda} E\left(e^{\lambda X_{n-1}} 1 - e^{\lambda X_{n-1}} \frac{X_{n-1}}{m}\right) + E\left(e^{\lambda X_{n-1}} \frac{X_{n-1}}{m}\right) = \\
&= e^{\lambda} f_{n-1}(e^{\lambda}) - \frac{e^{\lambda}}{m} E\left(e^{\lambda X_{n-1}} X_{n-1}\right) + \frac{1}{m} E\left(e^{\lambda X_{n-1}} X_{n-1}\right) = \\
&= e^{\lambda} f_{n-1}(e^{\lambda}) - \left(\frac{e^{\lambda} - 1}{m}\right) E\left(e^{\lambda X_{n-1}} X_{n-1}\right) = \\
&= e^{\lambda} f_{n-1}(e^{\lambda}) - \left(\frac{e^{\lambda} - 1}{m}\right) f'_{n-1}(e^{\lambda})
\end{aligned}
$$

i.e. it obtains that

$$
f_n(e^{\lambda}) = e^{\lambda} f_{n-1}(e^{\lambda}) - \left(\frac{e^{\lambda} - 1}{m}\right) f'_{n-1}(e^{\lambda})
$$

Changing variable $y = e^{\lambda}$, set $f_n(e^{\lambda}) = g_n(y)$, then making derivative w.r.t. λ

$$
g_n(y) = y\left[g_{n-1}(y) + \left(\frac{1-y}{m}\right) g'_{n-1}(y)\right] \tag{2}
$$

adding the condition $g_0(y) = 1$, that equivalent to $f_0(e^{\lambda}) = 1 = E(e^{\lambda X_0})$, i.e. at time 0 no coupon is collected.

Then following system has to be solved

$$
\begin{cases} g_n(y) = y\left[g_{n-1}(y) + \left(\frac{1-y}{m}\right) g'_{n-1}(y)\right] & \forall n \geq 1 \\ g_0(y) = 1 \end{cases} \tag{3}
$$

3 Recovering coupon collector's probabilities

To solve (3) the following solution is proposed

$$
g_n(y) = \sum_{k=1}^{n} \frac{y^k}{m^{n-k}} \prod_{h=0}^{k-1} \left(1 - \frac{h}{m}\right) a_{n,k} \tag{4}
$$

where $a_{n,k}$ coefficients are to be determined.

Solving recursively the system (3) it holds that:

For $n = 1$ it holds that $g_1(y) = y a_{1,1}$ then substituting in (3) results that $a_{1,1} = 1$.

For $n = 2$, remember that $a_{1,1} = 1$, it holds that

$$\frac{y}{m}a_{2,1}+y^2a_{2,2}\left(1-\frac{1}{m}\right)=\frac{y}{m}a_{1,1}+y^2a_{1,1}\left(1-\frac{1}{m}\right)$$
$$\frac{y}{m}a_{2,1}+y^2a_{2,2}\left(1-\frac{1}{m}\right)=\frac{y}{m}+y^2\left(1-\frac{1}{m}\right)$$

then $a_{2,1}=1$ and $a_{2,2}=1$.

For $n\geq 3$ the following general treatment is proposed.

Considering that

$$g_{n-1}(y)=\sum_{k=1}^{n-1}\frac{y^k}{m^{n-k-1}}\prod_{h=0}^{k-1}\left(1-\frac{h}{m}\right)a_{n-1,k}$$
$$g'_{n-1}(y)=\sum_{k=1}^{n-1}\frac{y^{k-1}}{m^{n-k-1}}k\prod_{h=0}^{k-1}\left(1-\frac{h}{m}\right)a_{n-1,k}$$

then substituting in (3) it holds that

$$\sum_{k=1}^{n}\frac{y^k}{m^{n-k}}\prod_{h=0}^{k-1}\left(1-\frac{h}{m}\right)a_{n,k}=y\left[\sum_{k=1}^{n-1}\frac{y^k}{m^{n-k-1}}\prod_{h=0}^{k-1}\left(1-\frac{h}{m}\right)a_{n-1,k}+\frac{1-y}{m}\sum_{k=1}^{n-1}\frac{y^{k-1}}{m^{n-k-1}}k\prod_{h=0}^{k-1}\left(1-\frac{h}{m}\right)a_{n-1,k}\right]$$

Working on the right side of the previous equation

$$\sum_{k=1}^{n-1}\frac{y^{k+1}}{m^{n-k-1}}\prod_{h=0}^{k-1}\left(1-\frac{h}{m}\right)a_{n-1,k}+y\frac{1-y}{m}\sum_{k=1}^{n-1}\frac{y^{k-1}}{m^{n-k-1}}k\prod_{h=0}^{k-1}\left(1-\frac{h}{m}\right)a_{n-1,k}=$$

$$=\sum_{k=1}^{n-1}\frac{y^{k+1}}{m^{n-k-1}}\prod_{h=0}^{k-1}\left(1-\frac{h}{m}\right)a_{n-1,k}+\frac{1}{m}\sum_{k=1}^{n-1}\frac{y^k k}{m^{n-k-1}}\prod_{h=0}^{k-1}\left(1-\frac{h}{m}\right)a_{n-1,k}-\frac{1}{m}\sum_{k=1}^{n-1}\frac{y^{k+1}k}{m^{n-k-1}}\prod_{h=0}^{k-1}\left(1-\frac{h}{m}\right)a_{n-1,k}=$$

$$=\sum_{k=1}^{n-1}\frac{y^{k+1}}{m^{n-k-1}}\prod_{h=0}^{k-1}\left(1-\frac{h}{m}\right)\left(1-\frac{k}{m}\right)a_{n-1,k}+\sum_{k=1}^{n-1}\frac{y^k}{m^{n-k}}k\prod_{h=0}^{k-1}\left(1-\frac{h}{m}\right)a_{n-1,k}$$

It is recovered that

$$\sum_{k=1}^{n}\frac{y^k}{m^{n-k}}\prod_{h=0}^{k-1}\left(1-\frac{h}{m}\right)a_{n,k}=\sum_{k=1}^{n-1}\frac{y^{k+1}}{m^{n-k-1}}\prod_{h=0}^{k-1}\left(1-\frac{h}{m}\right)\left(1-\frac{k}{m}\right)a_{n-1,k}+\sum_{k=1}^{n-1}\frac{y^k}{m^{n-k}}k\prod_{h=0}^{k-1}\left(1-\frac{h}{m}\right)a_{n-1,k} \tag{5}$$

Now recovering a general equation for coefficients $a_{n,k}$, from previous equation it holds that

$$\sum_{k=1}^{n}\frac{y^k}{m^{n-k}}\prod_{h=0}^{k-1}\left(1-\frac{h}{m}\right)a_{n,k}=\sum_{k=1}^{n-1}\frac{y^{k+1}}{m^{n-k-1}}\prod_{h=0}^{k-1}\left(1-\frac{h}{m}\right)\left(1-\frac{k}{m}\right)a_{n-1,k}+\sum_{k=1}^{n-1}\frac{y^k}{m^{n-k}}k\prod_{h=0}^{k-1}\left(1-\frac{h}{m}\right)a_{n-1,k}$$

$$\sum_{k=1}^{n}\frac{y^k}{m^{n-k}}\prod_{h=0}^{k-1}\left(1-\frac{h}{m}\right)a_{n,k}=\sum_{k=1}^{n-1}\frac{y^{k+1}}{m^{n-k-1}}\prod_{h=0}^{k}\left(1-\frac{h}{m}\right)a_{n-1,k}+\sum_{k=1}^{n-1}\frac{y^k}{m^{n-k}}k\prod_{h=0}^{k-1}\left(1-\frac{h}{m}\right)a_{n-1,k}$$

$$\sum_{k=1}^{n}\frac{y^k}{m^{n-k}}\prod_{h=0}^{k-1}\left(1-\frac{h}{m}\right)a_{n,k}=\sum_{k=2}^{n}\frac{y^k}{m^{n-k}}\prod_{h=0}^{k-1}\left(1-\frac{h}{m}\right)a_{n-1,k-1}+\sum_{k=1}^{n-1}\frac{y^k}{m^{n-k}}k\prod_{h=0}^{k-1}\left(1-\frac{h}{m}\right)a_{n-1,k}$$

Splitting the sums, w.r.t. k, of both side to apply polynomial identity rule to recover the coefficients $a_{n,k}$, i.e.

$$\begin{aligned}
&\sum_{k=2}^{n-1}\frac{y^k}{m^{n-k}}\prod_{h=0}^{k-1}\left(1-\frac{h}{m}\right)a_{n,k}+\frac{y}{m^{n-1}}\prod_{h=0}^{0}\left(1-\frac{h}{m}\right)a_{n,1}+\frac{y^n}{m^{n-n}}\prod_{h=0}^{n-1}\left(1-\frac{h}{m}\right)a_{n,n}=\\
&=\sum_{k=2}^{n-1}\frac{y^k}{m^{n-k}}\prod_{h=0}^{k-1}\left(1-\frac{h}{m}\right)a_{n-1,k-1}+\frac{y^n}{m^{n-n}}\prod_{h=0}^{n-1}\left(1-\frac{h}{m}\right)a_{n-1,n-1}+\\
&+\sum_{k=2}^{n-1}\frac{y^k}{m^{n-k}}k\prod_{h=0}^{k-1}\left(1-\frac{h}{m}\right)a_{n-1,k}+\frac{y}{m^{n-1}}\prod_{h=0}^{0}\left(1-\frac{h}{m}\right)a_{n-1,1}
\end{aligned}$$

By polynomial equality the following relations hold

$$a_{n,1}=a_{n-1,1}$$

$$a_{n,n}=a_{n-1,n-1}$$

$$a_{n,k}=a_{n-1,k-1}+ka_{n-1,k}$$

Now it has obtained that the coefficients $a_{n,k}$ are the Stirling Number of second kind type [4], i.e.

$$a_{n,k}=\frac{1}{k!}\sum_{j=1}^{k}(-1)^{k-j}\binom{k}{j}j^n$$

Finally it holds that

$$\left\{\begin{array}{ll} g_0(y)=1, & n=0 \\ g_n(y)=\sum_{k=1}^{n}\frac{y^k}{m^{n-k}}\prod_{h=0}^{k-1}\left(1-\frac{h}{m}\right)\frac{1}{k!}\sum_{j=1}^{k}(-1)^{k-j}\binom{k}{j}j^n, & n\leq m \\ g_n(y)=\sum_{k=1}^{m}\frac{y^k}{m^{n-k}}\prod_{h=0}^{k-1}\left(1-\frac{h}{m}\right)\frac{1}{k!}\sum_{j=1}^{k}(-1)^{k-j}\binom{k}{j}j^n, & n>m \end{array}\right. \tag{6}$$

Also from (6) using the properties of generating function the explicit form of $p_{n,k}$ is recovered, i.e.

$$\left\{\begin{array}{l} p_{0,k}=1, p_{0,k}=0, \quad \forall k\in[1,m] \\ p_{n,k}=\frac{1}{m^{n-k}}\prod_{h=0}^{k-1}\left(1-\frac{h}{m}\right)\frac{1}{k!}\sum_{j=1}^{k}(-1)^{k-j}\binom{k}{j}j^n, \qquad \forall n\geq 1, \forall k\in[1,m] \end{array}\right. \tag{7}$$

if in (7) the following equality $\frac{1}{m^{n-k}}\prod_{h=0}^{k-1}\left(1-\frac{h}{m}\right)=\frac{1}{m^n}\binom{m}{k}k!$ has applied, a simplified form of probabilities $p_{n,k}$ is obtained, i.e.

$$\left\{\begin{array}{l} p_{0,0}=1, p_{0,k}=0, \quad \forall k\in[1,m] \\ p_{n,k}=\frac{\binom{m}{k}}{m^n}\sum_{j=1}^{k}(-1)^{k-j}\binom{k}{j}j^n, \qquad \forall n\geq 1, \forall k\in[1,m] \end{array}\right. \tag{8}$$

4 Recovering generating function

Consider the following generating function

$$G_m(x,y) = \sum_{n=0}^{+\infty} \frac{x^n}{n!} g_n(y) \tag{9}$$

then

$$\begin{aligned}
G_m(x,y) = \sum_{n=0}^{+\infty} \frac{x^n}{n!} g_n(y) = 1 + \sum_{n=1}^{+\infty} \frac{x^n}{n!} g_n(y) = \\
= 1 + \sum_{n=1}^{m} \frac{x^n}{n!} \sum_{k=1}^{n} \frac{y^k}{m^{n-k}} \prod_{h=0}^{k-1} \left(1 - \frac{h}{m}\right) a_{n,k} + \sum_{n=m+1}^{+\infty} \frac{x^n}{n!} \sum_{k=1}^{m} \frac{y^k}{m^{n-k}} \prod_{h=0}^{k-1} \left(1 - \frac{h}{m}\right) a_{n,k} = \\
= 1 + \sum_{n=1}^{m} \frac{x^n}{n!} \sum_{k=1}^{n} \frac{y^k}{m^n} \binom{m}{k} k! a_{n,k} + \sum_{n=m+1}^{+\infty} \frac{x^n}{n!} \sum_{k=1}^{m} \frac{y^k}{m^n} \binom{m}{k} k! a_{n,k} = \\
= 1 + \sum_{n=1}^{m} \frac{x^n}{n!} \sum_{k=1}^{n} \frac{y^k}{m^n} \binom{m}{k} k! a_{n,k} + \sum_{k=1}^{m} y^k \binom{m}{k} k! \sum_{n=m+1}^{+\infty} \frac{x^n}{m^n n!} a_{n,k} = \\
= 1 + \sum_{n=1}^{m} \frac{x^n}{n!} \sum_{k=1}^{n} \frac{y^k}{m^n} \binom{m}{k} k! a_{n,k} + \sum_{k=1}^{m} y^k \binom{m}{k} k! \left[\sum_{n=1}^{+\infty} \frac{x^n}{m^n n!} a_{n,k} - \sum_{n=1}^{m} \frac{x^n}{m^n n!} a_{n,k} \right] =
\end{aligned}$$

using the properties $a_{n,k} = 0$ for $k > n$, it holds that

$$\begin{aligned}
= 1 + \sum_{k=1}^{n} y^k \binom{m}{k} k! \sum_{n=1}^{m} \frac{x^n}{m^n n!} a_{n,k} + \sum_{n=1}^{m} \frac{x^n}{n!} \sum_{k=1}^{n} \frac{y^k}{m^n} \binom{m}{k} k! a_{n,k} - \sum_{n=1}^{m} \frac{x^n}{m^n n!} \sum_{k=1}^{m} y^k \binom{m}{k} k! a_{n,k} = \\
= 1 + \sum_{k=1}^{m} y^k \binom{m}{k} k! \sum_{n=1}^{+\infty} \frac{x^n}{m^n n!} a_{n,k} - \sum_{n=1}^{m} \frac{x^n}{m^n n!} \sum_{k=n+1}^{m} y^k \binom{m}{k} k! a_{n,k} = \\
= 1 + \sum_{k=1}^{m} y^k \binom{m}{k} k! \sum_{n=1}^{+\infty} \frac{x^n}{m^n n!} a_{n,k}
\end{aligned}$$

now substituting the $a_{n,k}$ expression, a closed expression of generating function is retrieved

$$
\begin{aligned}
G_m(x,y) &= 1+\sum_{k=1}^{m} y^k \binom{m}{k} k! \sum_{n=1}^{+\infty} \frac{x^n}{m^n n!} a_{n,k} = \\
&= 1+\sum_{k=1}^{m} y^k \binom{m}{k} k! \sum_{n=1}^{+\infty} \frac{x^n}{m^n n!} \frac{1}{k!} \sum_{j=1}^{k} (-1)^{k-j} \binom{k}{j} j^n = \\
&= 1+\sum_{k=1}^{m} (-1)^k y^k \binom{m}{k} \sum_{j=1}^{k} (-1)^j \binom{k}{j} \sum_{n=1}^{+\infty} \frac{x^n}{m^n n!} j^n = \\
&= 1+\sum_{k=1}^{m} (-1)^k y^k \binom{m}{k} \sum_{j=1}^{k} (-1)^j \binom{k}{j} \left[e^{\frac{x}{m} j} - 1\right] = \\
&= 1+\sum_{k=1}^{m} (-1)^k y^k \binom{m}{k} \left[\left[\left(1-e^{\frac{x}{m}}\right)^k - 1\right] - \left[(1-1)^k - 1\right]\right] = \\
&= 1+\sum_{k=1}^{m} (-1)^k y^k \binom{m}{k} \left(1-e^{\frac{x}{m}}\right)^k = \\
&= \left[1-y\left(1-e^{\frac{x}{m}}\right)\right]^m
\end{aligned} \tag{10}
$$

References

[1] Adler, I., Oren, S., Ross,S. M., THE COUPON-COLLECTOR'S PROBLEM REVISITED, J.Appl.Prob. 40, 2003, 513518

[2] Brown, M., Pekoz, E.A., Ross,S. M., COUPON COLLECTING, Probability in the Engineering and Informational Sciences, 22, 2008, 221229

[4] Martin, A., A course in enumeration, First Edition, Springer, 2010

[3] Mahmoud, H., Polya Urn Models, 2008, Chapman & Hall/CRC